

INTEGRATION MAPPING OF REFUGEE AND MIGRANT CHILDREN

Working paper #1

# REPORT ON GENDER ISSUES REGARDING REFUGEE AND MIGRANT CHILDREN INTEGRATION





This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant greement No 822536

IMMERSE is a Horizon2020 funded project aimed at mapping the integration of refugee and migrant children in Europe. IMMERSE main goal is to define a new generation of indicators on the integration and socio-educational inclusion of refugee and migrant children in Europe incorporateing all relevant stakeholders (children and their families, researchers, NGOs, policymakers, educators or learning institutions) in the co-creation and validation of a dashboard of indicators in order to reflect their particular needs and expectations.

Author(s)

This paper has been written by Andrea Rutzen and Anne-Sophie Krys from DOZ e.V.

**Reviewer** Abdulaziz Ramadan from DOZ e.V.

Edition and layout Sofía Grau from INFODEF

**First published** November 2020

#### **IMMERSE** partners

Universidad Pontificia Comillas ICAI-ICADE | SPAIN Zabala Innovation Consulting | SPAIN INFODEF Instituto para el Fomento del Desarrollo y la Formación | SPAIN Ministerio de Trabajo, Migraciones y Seguridad Social | SPAIN Informática El Corte Inglés | SPAIN University College Cork | IRELAND Save the Children Italy | ITALY DOZ E. V. International | GERMANY Active Citizen Europe | BELGIUM Regional Directorate of Primary and Secondary Education of Crete | GREECE Panteion University of Social and Political Studies | GREECE

# **Table of contents**

1	Executive summary1
2	Introduction3
3	Literature Review on Gender and Migration3
3.1	Introduction
3.2	Gender Equality and Gender Mainstreaming in Relation to Education5
3.2.1	Gender Equality5
3.2.2	Gender Mainstreaming7
3.3	Gender at the Intersection with Migration8
4	Methodology of the Qualitative Research10
5	Context11
6	Discussion of the Results on Gender13
6.1	Gender-RelatedDimensions13
6.1.1	Gender and Identity13
6.1.2	Gender and Family15
6.1.3	Gender and School Environment17
6.1.4	Gender and Educational Attainment18
6.1.5	Gender and Culture20
6.2	Major Educational Gender Disparities22
7	Conclusion
Annex	
Biblio	Jraphy



# 1 Executive summary

Migration is a source of significant challenges and opportunities in Europe, as increasing flows of people seek new homes across the continent. International migrants made up approximately 11% of the total European population in 2019, or 82.3 million people, 2.8 million of whom are refugees and over 7 million of whom are below the age of 19 (Migration Data Portal, 2019). Recent years have also seen migrants from a much more diverse range of origin countries making their way to Europe, including to countries that had not previously been common migrant destinations. This movement places the successful integration of migrants and refugees into their host countries at the centre of migration policy in Europe.

This report details work carried out by IMMERSE on the identification of indicators of migrant children socio-educational integration. By adopting a systems-based approach, influenced by Bronfenbrenner's ecological systems theory, IMMERSE aimed at identifying indicators at the micro, meso and macro levels.

The inclusion of the voices of refugee and migrant children is essential to understand their lived experiences and to help plan appropriate social and educational integration systems. Therefore, in addition to including children and young people as research participants, there was also active involvement of migrant children and youth in the research design and monitoring of IMMERSE's work through the formation of a Children and Young People's Research Advisory Group.

Schools are chief among the social institutions impacted by migrant flows as key sites of integration and support for migrant children. This report details research on the socioeducational integration of refugee and migrant children carried out as part of the Horizon2020 research project Integration Mapping of Refugee and Migrant Children in Europe (IMMERSE). Research teams in Germany and Belgium conducted qualitative research focusing on the theme of gender and its relationship to integration through the lens of migrant and refugee children's experiences of education and school in their host countries. The IMMERSE teams in Spain, Italy, Ireland and Greece, also contributed findings related to gender issues emerging from their specific workshops, which were focused on multilingualism/interculturalism and psycho-social wellbeing. For details on IMMERSE research focusing on multilingualism/interculturalism and psycho-social wellbeing, please see the complementary reports compiled by the Spanish and



Italian research teams (D1.2 Report on Intercultural Competences and Multilingualism) and the Irish and Greek research teams (D1.3 Report on Psycho-Social Wellbeing).

The findings of this report are based on the qualitative data collection in all 6 countries that took place between May and September of 2019. Participants were key stakeholders in the socioeducational integration of migrant and refugee children at three levels:

- Micro level workshops with refugee and migrant children, aged 6-18 years, and workshops with parents of refugee and migrant children
- Meso level workshops with educators and representatives working within the field of migrant services
- Macro level individual interviews with policymakers and experts in the fields of education and/or integration

In total, there were over 420 child and adult participants between all countries (110 specifically in Germany and Belgium) representing a diverse range of ages, geographic, ethnic, cultural, and linguistic backgrounds, and personal circumstances, including unaccompanied minors.

Findings from these workshops and interviews pointed to critical factors related to gender affecting the socio-educational integration of children, and we identified five large themes connected to gender which were common to all 6 countries.

- Identity
- Family
- School environment
- Educational attainment
- Culture

The findings on the intersection between gender and integration from each country were not only highly aligned with each other, but also with the existing research literature. In particular, the importance of one's own identity and the dissonance of family and host country values were echoed by all the children's groups when they talked about relations to peers, parents, and teachers alike. Both participant experts and existing research have indicated that a sense of belonging in school can only be achieved when teachers, as well as social workers are well



versed in and practice gender sensitivity. In fact, the vital role of teachers and an overall gender sensitive school climate fosters success, satisfaction, as well as stability for migrant and refugee children and helps them to integrate and succeed academically, as was reiterated both during the children's and parents' workshops. Girls from certain backgrounds in particular lamented a lack of gender sensitivity in connection with their cultural and religious upbringing. Conversely, boys can suffer gender bias as much as girls, especially when seen through the lens of integration processes.

Indeed, discussion from all three levels of participants have shown that while no significant differences emerge in the sensitivity towards gender and self-awareness between children with and without a migratory background, gender impacts the socio-educational integration of refugee and migrant children, as it intersects with all other relevant topics.

# 2 Introduction

Although gender is but a part of one's identity, it is uniquely linked to all parts of social life. Thus, for the purpose of this report gender will be handled as a category. The objective of this report is therefore to discuss gender at the intersection of integration. Accordingly, section 3 reviews the existing literature, and via synthesis reflects on gender, gender relations, and gender dimensions at the junction of migrant and refugee children and socio-educational integration. Sections 4 and 5 briefly highlight the methodology agreed upon the partners and the immigration contexts in Belgium and Germany. Section 6 discusses all relevant cross-country results obtained during the qualitative research in all countries participating in the IMMERSE project. The results discussion is three-fold. First, the identified main gender-related correlates are evaluated. In a second step, the results are presented in relation to the other two main themes – Multilingualism and Interculturalism, and Psychosocial Wellbeing – in order to more accurately specify possible interactions. In the third and last step, the results are then contextualised in terms of the major educational gender disparities. Sction 7 then provides the conclusions on the results and highlight direct implications for the dashboard of indicators derived from the findings. Finally, the Annex presents the gender breakdown of participants in the different workshops by country.



# 3 Literature Review on Gender and Migration3.1 Introduction

"The term 'gender' was introduced to social science in order to underline the difference between socially and biologically determined sex. It encompasses both men's and women's active roles in society and their ideas about 'maleness' and 'femaleness'. Through these ideas, gender produces and institutionalizes asymmetries on the basis of sex (Bjerén 1997, Stølen 1991, Tienda and Booth 1991). In other words, gender relations simultaneously produce and are reproduced by social practice." (Carling. 2005. 3.)

Both, gender and integration are much debated terms in politics, social discourses, and education. (Cheung. 2017. 212.) While Sex is a biological category which entails different biological and physiological characteristics of males and females, such as reproductive organs, chromosomes, hormones, etc., gender must be considered as far more complex. Gender can be identified as an abstract and socially constructed category within different classification systems of societies and cultures by which they organize and define sexual role attributions as social roles. For the sake of synthesis, we propose the following definition made by the WHO:

"Gender refers to the socially constructed characteristics of women and men – such as norms, roles and relationships of and between groups of women and men. It varies from society to society and can be changed. While most people are born either male or female, they are taught appropriate norms and behaviours – including how they should interact with others of the same or opposite sex within households, communities and workplaces. When individuals or groups do not "fit" established gender norms they often face stigma, discriminatory practices or social exclusion [...]." (WHO. 2011.)

However, we argue that gender must be considered an ideologically constructed concept which can be understood and defined alongside a continuum of categories of thought, i.e. culture, religion, and tradition. "Concepts are taught to us by our parents as we learn language; different cultures have overlapping but also distinct concepts and ideas; and concepts as well as ideas evolve over time as a result of historical changes, science, technological advances, etc. (Haslanger, 2017: 1.) Especially in conjunction with migration, established gender roles, dimensions, and norms face challenges in terms of competing cultural systems. Gender than is one part of an individual identity within a social identity which is represented by a specific Diaspora as a whole, such as the Muslim Diaspora. In most cases, what follows is an intricate negotiating process. (Moghissi. 2006.)



Although public discourse prefers to handle gender as a singular category, gender should never be considered alone. Respectively, a person's biologically determined sex does not necessarily correspond with the gender identity of the same person. What is more, gender identities are intricately tied to every other facet of a person's identity and influenced by gender norms and gender roles. "Socially and psychologically, an individual's gender identification is one crucible of a comprehensive identity. [...] As a result, identities are multiple, fluid, and in flux." (Stimpson and Herdt, 2014: 4). Furthermore, while sexual orientation might be considered a part of one's gender identity, it is not in any way to be defined by a person's sexual orientation. For the purpose of simplification, we have chosen the following definition by the GIZ:

"Gender identity refers to each person's deeply felt individual experience of gender, which may or may not correspond with the sex assigned at birth. Gender identity includes the personal sense of the body (which may involve, if freely chosen, modification of bodily appearance or function) and other expressions of gender, including dress, speech and mannerisms." (GIZ. 2013. 2.)

Moreover, gender roles are intricately linked with every other aspect of the identity of one person and always correlate with gender relations which "are always mediated by other socially constructed categories such as class, age, 'race' and ethnicity". (Carling. 2005. 3.)

For the sake of thematic relevance, the following pages will look more closely at the concepts of gender equality, the practice of gender mainstreaming, gender in relation to migration, and gender in relation to education.

# 3.2 Gender Equality and Gender Mainstreaming in Relation to Education

#### 3.2.1 Gender Equality

"Gender parity is a statistical measure that provides a numerical value of female-to-male or girlto-boy ratio for indicators such as income or education. For example, if there are equal number of girls and boys who completed primary education in a specific country, the gender parity ratio for that indicator is one. The greater the difference between girls and boys, the lower is the gender parity value. Gender parity is a useful tool for assessing gender inequality in specific areas, in setting goals, and in assessing change and progress under specific indicators of gender equality." (Manlosa and Matias. 2018.)



While gender parity is a tool to index disparities – especially in education – gender equality is a concept which has been development over time. According to the European Institute for Gender Equality it is defined as:

[Gender equality] refers to the equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities of women and men and girls and boys. Equality does not mean that women and men will become the same but that women's and men's rights, responsibilities and opportunities will not depend on whether they are born male or female. Gender equality implies that the interests, needs and priorities of both women and men are taken into consideration, recognizing the diversity of different groups of women and men. Gender equality is not a women's issue but should concern and fully engage men as well as women. Equality between women and men is seen both as a human rights issue and as a precondition for, and indicator of, sustainable people-centred development. (European Institute for Gender Equality.)

Both, in a global and a European context, gender equality translates to a variety of policies on many different levels. For instance, the European Commission promotes gender equality as follows: "Promoting equal economic independence for women and men, closing the gender pay gap, advancing gender balance in decision making, ending gender-based violence and promoting gender equality beyond the EU." (European Commission.)

In reality, gender equality is a much-contested subject. Equality presupposes inequality, and "it has been assumed that the ideal of equality could be realized by means of (equal) legislation. In practice, this has meant that formal (i.e. legislative) hindrances in the way of equality has been abolished." (Parvikko. 1990. 92.) However, [i]ts contested character is obscured partly by its frequent appearance as a harmonious and a-conflictual concept, either due to a tendency to homogenize diversity under a dominant norm (for instance, that of the European Union) or due to an explicit "strategic framing" of the concept to make it enter more easily into the policy agenda as a common and accepted goal." (Verloo and Lombardo. 2007. 22.)

In the context of education, it needs to be stressed that equality and equity are not interchangeable. While equality should be defined as an expression of claim for equal access "[e]quity derives from a concept of social justice" (Falk et al.1993: 2) and is an expression of claim for balancing the objectively given inequalities.



Gender has an undeniable influence on educational performance and attainment but is also an indicator of educational equity itself. As such, it has been argued that "gender differences might amplify other kinds of inequalities, such as racial, ethnic, class, or nativity inequalities". (Buchmann et al. 2008. 319.) According to the latest *Global Education Monitoring Report Gender Review*, gender-related educational disparity and inequality persist to this day. The report looks closely on both monitoring and evaluation of gender in education as well as main gender disparities. Potential indicators of gender inequality in educations have been identified by Peppin Vaughan et al in 2016 by the following domains:

- Educational opportunities
- Gender norms, values and attitudes
- Institutions outside education
- Laws and policies in education systems
- Resource distribution
- Teaching and learning opportunities. (UNESCO. 2018. 10.)

The mapping indicators itself have been defined as follows:

Gender parity index on enrolment

- Constitutional approaches to gender equality
- Constitutional Protection of the right to education
- Gender Policies on gender equality in education
- Percentage of women in school leadership
- Gender parity in teacher education
- Gender parity in teacher employment
- Gender parity in teacher pay
- Percentage of single-sex toilets
- Percentage of children who receive incentives to attend school
- Percentage of teachers who received gender sensitivity training

Percentage of countries that include gender equality topics in their school curricula (UNESCO. 2018. 10.)



Despite findings of persisting educational inequality for girls and women globally – as is presented in the latest UNESCO Gender Review, which is part of its *Global Education Monitoring Report* – girls outperform boys in educational performance and attainment throughout Europe (OECD, 2012.) Overall inequalities for female students are mainly connected to restrictions of access to general education, especially in countries of the global South (UNESCO, 2018.) However, in a European context, when access to education is provided to girls, other gender-related factors apply. Gender stereotypes, gender bias, gender-based violence in correlating with other determinants, such as ethnicity, are high value barriers for educational performance and overall attainment. In fact, a study done by Phalet at al has indicated that "ethnic differences coexist with a cross-ethnic gender gap in attainment." (Phalet et al. 2007. 401.)

#### 3.2.2 Gender Mainstreaming

The European Institute for Gender Equality defines gender mainstreaming as:

"The systematic consideration of the differences between the conditions, situations and needs of women and men in all Community policies and actions. Gender mainstreaming is the (re)organisation, improvement, development and evaluation of policy processes, so that a gender equality perspective is incorporated in all policies at all levels and all stages, by the actors normally involved in policymaking. Mainstreaming a gender perspective is the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programs, in all areas and at all levels. It is a way to make women's as well as men's concerns and experiences an integral dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programs in all political, economic and societal spheres so that women and men benefit equally, and inequality is not perpetuated. The ultimate goal is to achieve gender equality." (European Institute for Gender Equality.)

Following the *Fourth World Conference on Women* in Beijing in 1995, gender mainstreaming has become common practice on all levels of legislation as well as execution. Born out of the wish for the empowerment of girls and women, gender mainstreaming can be criticised as the engendering policy-making process as well as the respective practices. Concerning educational equality, it can be argued that that conditions have shifted in a way that puts boys at a disadvantage.

8



Gender bias, whichever way it goes, is a widely discussed subject regarding education, school environment, curriculum, and educational practice.

"When teachers show gender bias it has an impact on the students. When the teachers expect certain behavior on the basis of gender, it influences children's views and ideas about gender and gender roles. Teachers facilitate gender bias by using gender to organize students. Based on children's academic performance teachers may suggest them to choose higher studies and job. When the teachers' opinion and or suggestions are influenced by traditional gender role their suggestions become biased." (Sekhar and Parameswari. 2017. 46.)

#### 3.3 Gender at the Intersection with Migration

Over the last decade, more research literature has been dedicated to the complexities gender shows in conjunction with migration. While migration studies were gender-blind for decades, newer migration research has suggested to rather study gender relations than one gender or the other. (Carling, 2005: 3ff).

Beginning with the United Nations Decade for Women (1970), Women in Development (WID) became the motto of further research and advocacy. However, WID later was criticised for its one-dimensionality and the exclusion of men in the discussion. It was argued to think of both genders in relation to development and the focus shifted away from this to Gender in Development (GID). (Razavi and Miller, 1995.) From there, the overall focus was widened to include migration. Migration as such always also includes Diasporas. "It is useful to think of diasporas as fluid, performative, and relational rather than as fixed entities emanating from transnational movements across space." (Creese, 2014: 156). Gender and Diaspora studies of late have indicated the strong intersectionality between the two. Exactly at this intersection, gender along with generation and identity is undergoing constant transformation. For instance, Brubaker argued that [w]e should think of diaspora in the first instance as a category of practice, and only then ask whether, and how, it can fruitfully be used as a category of analysis. As a category of practice, 'diaspora' is used to make claims, to articulate projects, to formulate expectations, to mobilize energies, to appeal to loyalties. (Brubaker, 2005: 12)

Concurrently, diasporic identities are "inherently gendered [...], as members refashion acceptable modes of masculinity and femininity, and invariably fluid, as the next generation mediates new forms of hybridity." (Creese, 2014: 157) This is of importance for the socio-educational



integration of refugee and migrant children as it indicates to negotiating processes and practice within the community of origin as well as within the host community. As for migration, it has been argued that it is itself gendered.

"Migration patterns, migration discourse and underlying representations, migrants' experiences, obligations and duties as well as the expectations relative to their migration are gendered. Women and men not only engage in migrations and mobility differently, inducing differential impact on those who remain non-migrants, but their movements are better understood in the light of hegemonic/contesting femininities and masculinities."(Morokvašić. 2014: 355)

In fact, the IOM states that "[i]t is recognized that a person's sex, gender, gender identity and sexual orientation shape every stage of the migration experience" (IOM, n.d.). More specifically, gender has an impact on migratory paths, patterns, experiences as well as risks and vulnerabilities for specific groups during and after migration. (Andall. 2013; IOMn.d.; Kofman et al. 2005) For instance, in terms of health, gender has an impact on whose educational success is affected. Previous trauma can affect both mental and physical health of the children and enhance vulnerabilities even more dramatically. According to a new policy paper issued by the UNESCO Global Education Monitoring Report on *Education as healing: Addressing the trauma of displacement through social and emotional learning*, trauma prevalence in migrant and refugee children is high and it significantly effects learning.

Gendered prevalence of mental health issues as well as the correlation with social roles other than gender roles are of particular interest as they imply a higher vulnerability for one specific gender or the other. A recent study conducted by Alsan et al indicates that gender roles are still significantly different for boys and girls, which in turn impacts education as much as health. (Alsan et al. 2017. 140. and Klein and Alden. 2017. 1.) What is more, "[m]ost findings of gender differences in posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) prevalence found that females are reported to be diagnosed with PTSD after a trauma twice as often as males and developed stronger PTSD symptoms than males." (Hu et al. 2017. 22.) Conversely, considering, almost 90% of all unaccompanied adolescents are male it must be considered that this group is particularly vulnerable. Their vulnerabilities are gendered as much as they are challenged by gender bias and stereotypes coupled with discrimination due to origin.



In conclusion, it can be said that "[a]lthough migration is largely beneficial, many constraints such as restrictive social norms or laws, gender or racial discrimination, or gender-specific vulnerabilities—limit the opportunities and benefits" (Fleury, 2016: Vii) for refugee and migrant children on their way to a wholesome socio-educational integration.

# 4 Methodology of the Qualitative Research

As was agreed upon with all partners, the co-creation methodology developed provided a toolbox for facilitating the selection, recruitment process, organization and dynamization of the proposed research activities and was implemented in each case by two partner countries. Following the common conceptual framework, in a first step, DOZ completed a literary review on gender in order to provide all partners with a synthesis document on gender and education related issues. For the preparation of the document, DOZ consulted with its Belgian partner ACE and then sent the document to all partners. The synthesis document on gender and integration included a short introduction on terminology and concepts, gender issues relating to the integration and education of migrant and refugee children, and peer guidance on gender issues combined with relevant questions for all partners. During the initial phase, the bilateral stakeholder mapping was especially helpful, as it provided an overview of the country-specific landscapes in Germany and Belgium and helped synchronize the work efforts for the qualitative research tasks.

The teams in Germany and Belgium agreed on outlined workshops for the different age groups of children, questions pertaining to gender, matrix grits for the parent's focus groups, an observation template, guidance for the meso level expert focus groups, and assistance with approaching guideline-based expert interviews. All micro and meso-level activities were conducted by at least two researchers, one (or more) to facilitate the activities and one to take detailed notes on observations.

For the children's micro-level workshops, DOZ prepared and provided ACE with detailed and structured workshop templates in order to guarantee robustness of the research and the findings; detailing for each age group the activities with objectives, timing indications, opening and probing questions, description of participatory techniques and necessary logistics.

For the parents as well as the meso-level experts DOZ chose the focus group as the method to facilitate the research. For both groups a guideline was prepared, detailing the introductions, the



presentation of the project, a group agreement, opening and probing questions, and 15 detailed questions covering all the three main topics of intercultural competences/multilingualism, psychosocial wellbeing and gender.

The macro-level expert interviews have been prepared for three fields of expertise (education, administration, and politics) and considered the background of identified policy guidelines, contemporary scientific findings, and administrative practice in Germany and Belgium. In order to ensure the facilitation interviews, DOZ prepared a sample of a semi-structured guideline-based interview to its Belgian partner and guided them to prepare the interviews by grounding them in basic research on each targeted macro-level expert and their respective field of expertise. All interviews lasted between 45 and 90 minutes. The interviews were divided into 4 main parts with

questions relating to the position, responsibilities and skills of the expert being interviewed, issues related to children's well-being, issues related to intercultural competence and multilingualism, and gender issues. All activities were recorded and transcribed for the subsequent category analysis. The preliminary findings on the other two topics of psychosocial wellbeing and intercultural competences and multilingualism were then send to the respective partners in charge of the topical reports.

## 5 Context

Germany is a traditional destination country for European and non-European migrants since the 1950s, when Germany transformed from a land of emigration to a receiving country. For over three decades, up to the 1990s, most immigrants were recruited as guest workers. The first "Agreement on the Recruitment and Placement of Workers" ("Abkommen über Anwerbung und Vermittlung von Arbeitskräften") was negotiated with Italy in 1955. Further contracts soon followed: with Greece and Spain (1960), Turkey (1961), Morocco (1963), Portugal (1964), Tunisia (1965) and Yugoslavia (1968). In the new millennium, the number of asylum applications – especially those providing subsidary protection – has steadily risen, increasing the weight of refugees and, in particular, persons receiving subsidiary protection, among the migrant-origin population in Germany. This situation reached a peak in 2015, when Germany received 36% of all asylum applications throughout Europe, in that record-breaking year in terms of exponential increase of asylum applications in the continent. In 2018, 20.8 million of the 81.6 million



inhabitants in Germany had a migration background (immigrants and their descendants). This corresponds to 25.5 percent of the total population (Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung). Of the 20.8 million people with a migration background, 10.9 million were Germans and 9.9 million foreigners (52.4 and 47.6 per cent, respectively). In 2018, most people with a migration background came from an EU-27 member state (particularly Romania, Italy and Poland), Turkey, and Russia. Kazakhstan and Syria are the most important non-European countries of origin with shares of 6.0 and 3.9 per cent respectively. In Germany the legal foundations and the implementation of the overall immigration and integration policies do differ from one federal state to another. In turn, this leads to varying degrees of success with integrating migrant and refugee children into the education system.

In Belgium, immigration history and recent developments are similar to Germany in character. Overall, the Benelux region has always been a highly mobile one. In the 1960s, Belgium has ratified bilateral agreements for the recruitment of labour workers with Southern European and North African countries and Turkey. In 2019, about 1.4 million people were foreign born nationals. Among the top five countries of origin are France, the Netherlands, Italy, Romania, and Morocco. (Statista 2019.) Two special features are of particular importance in Belgium. First, since the 1950s Belgium has served as the capital of European Union and therefore has seen an influx of EU citizens immigrating to Belgium. Secondly, the country is one divided by two distinctly different regions; both linguistically and political. This is division has led to significantly higher public as well as political tension in the Flemish region than is the case for Wallonia. In comparison, over the last decade, both countries have struggled to unify and stabilize their asylum as well as integration policies. "In Belgium, the Communities (Flemish, French and German) and the Regions (Flanders, Wallonia and Brussels) are responsible for the integration and civic integration of foreign nationals. In Brussels, the Flemish Community Commission (VGC) is responsible for the integration policy of the Dutch-speaking people in Brussels, while the French Community Commission (COCOF) coordinates the integration policies for the Frenchspeaking residents in Brussels." (Belgian Contact Point of the European Migration Network, 2017: 70)

Both Germany and Belgium have in common that they have pursued reactionary rather than proactive asylum and integration policies in the last years.



# 6 Discussion of the Results on Gender6.1 Gender-Related Dimensions

All the following results have been identified as relevant across the six countries in the qualitative preliminary findings. These large topics largely coincide with existing findings in the research literature. Consequently, country-specific findings will be indicated when necessary.



#### 6.1.1 Gender and Identity

The first gender-related dimension has been identified as identity. For the purpose of this paper, identity will be defined as follows: ""identity" is presently used in two linked senses, which may be termed "social" and "personal." In the former sense, an "identity" refers simply to a social category, a set of persons marked by a label and distinguished by rules deciding membership and (alleged) characteristic features or attributes. In the second sense of personal identity, an identity is some distinguishing characteristic (or characteristics) that a person takes a special pride in or views as socially consequential but more-or-less unchangeable." (Fearon, 1999: 2) In respect to gender, the following three cross-country correlates could be identified:

- behaviour,
- peer attachment,



• and sensitivity to and/or knowledge about gender roles and norms.

#### **BEHAVIOUR**

In terms of behaviour, the first characteristic correlating with gender is the use of binary language. Language was used by children and adolescents alike in an exclusively gendered binary way. During the qualitative workshops, binary language has been applied to both express and describe themselves and to refer to their surroundings and different relations; especially with peers and teachers. While the use of binary language was detected, a sensitivity to gender roles and norms was rarely expressed openly. These sensitivities where mostly masked by laughter, withdrawal, or ignorance; depending on the age of the children. However, even if they were mainly expressed indirectly, we will regard them as given.

The second notable behavioural characteristic correlating with gender is the adherence to rules in correlation with self-confidence. While girls repeatedly expressed a high work motivation, a strong sense of duty, and a certain sense for order and conduct in their everyday school life, they presented an overall lower percentage in self-confidence in comparison to the boys. As such it was voiced especially by younger children that it would be *"[b]etter for girls if schools were stricter with boys than [they are] with girls" [Child, 10-12, Belgium].* 

Further, girls – particularly in the younger age groups – showed a higher maturity than boys. This maturity has been substantiated both by physical as well as discursive differences between girls and boys. While boys show a higher proclivity towards a more physical conduct, girls showed strong tendencies to express themselves, as well as to stand up for others via the explicit use of language. For example; *"[b]oys are crazy and mad and stupid, but girls are kind and nice"* [Child, 10-12, Belgium].

#### PEER ATTACHMENT

Peer attachment is significantly correlating with gender. In the direct comparison, boys show an overall higher measure of peer attachments by number. This prevalence was further confirmed by macro-level experts such as the National Commission on the Rights of the Child in Belgium:



"In the survey, we have made the separation between boys and girls. So, we had some difference between the groups, for example, [inaudible], but boys made friends easier than girls. Boys feel less lonely than girls."

However, where gender is concerned, both girls and boys have a high propensity to mingle with peers of their own identified gender. What is more, children and their declared best friends mainly were of the same gender.

#### SENSITIVITY TO AND /OR KNOWLEDGE ABOUT GENDER ROLES AND NORMS

A significant difference in the sensitivity towards gender and self-awareness between children with and without a migratory background could not be confirmed.

#### 6.1.2 Gender and Family

The second gender-related dimension has been identified as family. The following two crosscountry correlates could be specified:

- gender roles and norms and
- other values.

#### GENDER ROLES AND NORMS

Gender roles in families are never predetermined first by the family itself, but rather by the society in which each family is grounded in. "A gender role is a behaviour learned by a person as desirable, acceptable appropriate, to their gender, determined by the prevailing cultural norms. In society, the gender role continues through generation." (Sekhar and Parameswari, 2017: 45.)

In terms of familial gender roles this means that differing specific norms dictate respective prescriptions according to gender. In terms of migrant and refugee children any given family model might be then challenged by entering a new normative societal context. During the activities of the qualitative research, especially younger children have displayed the struggle between what is and what could be. In many cases, this leads to tensions between their own forming identities, the realm of possibilities in the host country, and the families deep-rooted own system of gender roles, norms. Consequently, this results in completely new discursive negotiating processes taking place in private as well as in public.



"She must respect her religion and expectations. She is and will remain Muslim. We explain that they should try different things. She can try shorts, try them and see why we are right and then accepts this." [Mother in Belgium]

While overall gender roles and norms equally apply to both genders, parental expectations can differ depending on the gender of the child. In most cases, these expectations are then adopted by both female and male children. For instance, what turned out to be particularly remarkable during the qualitative workshops was that the adolescents had clear ideas about future occupations; some of which were clearly gendered: *"To be successful boys need to become doctors or engineers and girls pharmacists"* [Adolescent, 17-18, Germany].

Further, male parenting and its role for a holistic school and education involvement has been stressed by macro-level experts. When asked if there have been any efforts to involve men as parents even more in the educational process of their children the Saxonian state minister for equality and integration in Germany reiterated the importance of gender equality and cultural negotiation:

"Fathers as well as mothers with a migration background are invited to all school dates, e.g. parent-teacher talks, parent-teacher evenings, school parties, class outings etc., because rights and obligations to parental participation in schools apply to all parents. It takes different amounts of time to break up traditional rules and habits from the culture of origin. This is a matter of culturally sensitive negotiation processes, which are important so that the children feel comfortable in the educational institutions and are successful."

#### OTHER VALUES

Closely linked with a family's gender roles and norms are other values, such as religious beliefs or other culturally determined belief systems, as well as the respective traditions. In terms of gender, friction could be determined whenever these values were challenged by deviating norms or value systems of the host society. While certain unknown practices – such as swim classes for boys and girls or overall coeducation of boys and girls – are mostly affecting girls, religious practice and feasts tend to affect both genders.

Other than that, most parents, as well as the adolescents, have stressed the importance of the future. A good future was determined to be one of occupational success and a live in the new



society as *"a good citizen" [Male parent, Germany]*. While quite a lot of parents praised the value of family, only few children were uttering a wish for a family of their own. Gender notwithstanding, future for them is made of dreams, careers, friends, and safety.

#### 6.1.3 Gender and School Environment

In the context of the analysis, school environment means both personal and systemic factors. The third gender-related dimension displayed the following two noticeable cross-country correlates:

- teacher-peer attachment and
- gender stereotypes and female professionals.

#### TEACHER-PEER ATTACHMENT

Regarding teacher-peer attachment, the importance of good teacher-student relations was confirmed on all levels of the qualitative research. Gender notwithstanding, most of the children one way or another stressed how much importance they placed on a "good" teacher. A trustworthy teacher is ascribed the function of a role model by association of the students. In a classroom setting the teachers' role is comparable to the roles of the female and male parents respectively.

#### GENDER STEREOTYPES AND FEMALE PROFESSIONALS

The teaching profession still is a predominantly female one across Europe and all OECD countries. (OECD Stat, 2017; Eurostat, 2015.) However, over the last decade many scholars have stressed repeatedly that a teachers' professionalism and effectiveness is in fact not determined by their respective gender, but rather the ability to teach effectively. (Martino 2012; Majzub 2010.)

During the qualitative research, meso-group professionals have confided that female teachers experience a higher occurrence of problems due to gender tensions. The participants reported that parents from certain backgrounds showed a higher avoidance tendency towards female teachers. They refused to shake hands, look teachers in the eye, or speak directly to them.



What is more, male students also showed a lower acceptance of female teachers. In cases, they would not tolerate female authority and ultimately dismiss disciplinary actions by those female professionals. In Ireland, a macro-level expert discussed these issues connected to different cultural attitudes towards women: *"I know it was an issue when kids were integrating into schools; the idea of their cultural view of women and women teachers and being told what to do by women teachers".* 

Conversely, these stereotypes have a high potential to be employed by teachers when it comes to male students. A teacher with migratory background himself had this to say about it:

"There are stereotypes and prejudices. I experienced this myself at school. For example, there is the traditional prejudice of teachers towards the migrant boys who are of "oriental" origin. They say, "no, they don't respect me", "they don't take me seriously as a woman". This is a self-fulfilling prophecy. This is called the Pygmalion effect, where a person reiterates: "They won't take me seriously anyway because I'm a woman and they come from a family where the man is the absolute overlord and where the boys are raised like the Pasha." There are prejudices which you must counteract by further training but also proactively in teacher training and that is a task for all of society. Of course, there are some families were there is no doubt about this. But there are also families without a migrant background, where the young man is raised like a Pasha. You must be careful about that. I noticed this during my time of service at school and I always tried to intervene gently and say: "Yes, dear colleague, but is it really so or can you perhaps see whether it can be a prejudice or stereotype? "and you can have a bit of an effect."

#### 6.1.4 Gender and Educational Attainment

As the fourth gender-related dimension educational attainment emerged. The following two cross-country correlates have been determined:

- developmental and educational expectations and
- student performance.

#### DEVELOPMENTAL AND EDUCATIONAL EXPECTATIONS

The qualitative meso-level workshops have indicated that early childhood expectations of educational development and attainment are more pronounced in girls than boys. This was substantiated by the children themselves throughout the micro-level workshops.



In comparison, girls display a stricter observance of rules and appreciate a quiet learning environment. Behavioural differences as well as adherence to gender roles plays an important role in what girls expect for their future development and educational path. However, in certain cultural contexts girls have lower expectations due to domestic responsibilities ascribed to them by their gender and practices such as child [arranged] marriage. They simultaneously express their wish for an education and are acutely aware of future restriction ascribed to by family traditions.

"I'm going to turn 14 and they will tell me to get married, so I'm going to have to make such a big effort to oppose that. Now that I'm already 11 my mind is spinning because I don't know if when I turn 14, I'm going to stand firm, I'm going to stand firm ... If I'm not going to stand firm why am I going to study at 11? There has been one that stood firm and said: 'I'm going to continue studying' and she showed up in a police station and said: 'They want to marry me' and the protection system has taken care of her. But that was very traumatic, and it has not ended well, that is. Two years later she was married. Because breaking with that is ... break up with everything."

#### [Romani Girl in Spain]

On the other hand, boys have lower interest in and expectations of educational success; especially in the age ranges between 10 to 16. What is more, expectations of missing classes or dropping out of school entirely were strikingly higher with boys.

#### STUDENT PERFORMANCE

In terms of overall educational performance and attainment, it can be ascertained that girls are more successful than boys. In turn, some meso-level and macro-level experts have stressed the need for special attention for boys and their school performance. In fact, this argument is substantiated by worldwide figures – including the six countries involved in the IMMERSE project – showing persistent underperformance by boys in terms of language competence, grades, levels of educational attainment, and dropout rates. (UNESCO. 2017. Eurostat. 2019.) Eurostat covers the years from 2009-2018 and by level of attainment, sex, and age. Most of these figures show total ratios and do not account for migratory backgrounds. However, they support the general argument.



Overall gender mainstreaming in gender policies have had an immense impact on the lack of attention payed to male students in comparison to female students. What is more, those policies paired with gender and "ethnical" stereotypes more than often place a double jeopardy on male students with a migration or refugee background and further an already consistent gender bias towards the "underperforming" boys.

Conversely, another gendered dimension of educational inequality emerges. While girls present a greater educational potential, which is supported by gender policies and recommendations as much as actual school practice, said potential is not fully recognised nor valued at the intersection with migration and educational integration. The socialisation of gender in schools persistently reminds the girls that they are different.

In fact, in recent years more and more scholars have contended that educational gender disparities, such as educational attainment, are notably amplified at the intersection with migration.

#### 6.1.5 Gender and Culture

As the fifth gender-related dimension culture could be determined. Against the background of family and society the following two cross-country correlates have been identified:

- shifts in gender roles and
- cultural dissonances.

#### SHIFTS IN GENDER ROLES

Gender roles are intricately linked with identities. Determined by culture and reiterated and reproduced by the family and every other socialisation institution (Kindergarten, School etc.), identities, however, are not static. The fluidity of gender roles varies with any given culture. The extent to how much any person is adhering to the expected gender behaviour is called gender conformity and is "influenced as much by the social situation in which the conformity occurs as by gender differences themselves" (Jhangiani and Tarry. 2014. 311.).

During the qualitative research a shift in gender roles could be detected among migrant and refugee children. The shift has been determined as one of challenge. Especially adolescents



challenge certain expected gender behaviours. Their expressed curiosity for the host countries' customs, the gender role expectations of the parents, and the demands of the host country in synergy open new avenues for the further development of gender identities and gender conformity, or, in fact, non-conformity for the children.

Consequently, new negotiation processes follow, which affect the girls more than the boys, yet are negotiated by all parties involved. Interestingly, girls might be allowed to play "male" games or with as "male" perceived toys while the opposite is not desirable for boys. *"I'm for football for all! For animals, too! Anyone who has a foot can play football."* [Boy 10-12, Germany]

#### CULTURAL DISSONANCES

Gender is but one feature of culture and an identity-giving element for the individual. In the case of migrant children and their parents the encounter with the culture of the host country in some cases leads to challenges, conflicts, and an expressed sense of cultural dissonance.

During the qualitative research, all parents in all countries expressed a sense of uprooting and fear of loss of culture. This is especially true for the groups of refugee families. Cultural dissonance was most evident where parents perceived the changes in their children over a longer period. Parents, whether male or female, voiced an uncertainty when it came to their children's identities. Familial gender roles, beside other values were challenged where those roles intersected closely with religious belief and practice; i.e. when religious belief dictates a gender conform set family structure and specific norms and prescription accordingly.

In relation to education, gender-related cultural dissonances appear whenever two customary systems do not compare initially. All the following examples are considered value-free in the context of this analysis. They rather serve to illustrate the two-sidedness of cultural dissonance. In Belgium education is compulsory for all children – as it is in all other countries taking part in the IMMERSE project – yet not all schools accept the female students to wear a Hijab: *"Education is compulsory, but sometimes their parents want girls to wear the veil, and not all schools allow it" [School coordination for reception centers in Belgium]*. Another example is the existing or non-existing co-education of boys and girls. For instance, in Ireland gender segregated schools are a given and there meso level experts felt that at least a small number of migrant families preferred it that way. Furthermore, children's rights and child-friendly education, which are upheld in the



European context, are not always regarded as commonplace by all families. Conversely, some families were assessed by meso level experts as more conservative, or as coming from authoritarian cultures in which the father is the ultimate authority figure: *"regardless of what age you are, you're living under his roof, you do what he says"* [example given by meso level experts in *Ireland*].

In addition, many dissonances have been identified at the intersections of racism, gender-based discrimination and economic disadvantage. An overall emotional ambivalence towards the host country and its corpus of values and educational style emerged whenever other factors played into a family's satisfaction. Dissatisfaction with the socio-economic situation paired with experiences of racism and gender-based discrimination was expressed primarily by parents and adolescent girls.

### 6.2 Major Educational Gender Disparities

Gender parity aims at "achieving equal participation of girls and boys in all forms of education based on their proportion in the relevant age-groups in the population" (Subrahmanian. 2005. 395.). Equal participation of girls and boys, whether with or without migration background, however, is still not a given. In direct comparison, the following major gender disparities could be found among female and male refugee and migrant children.

#### FEMALE STUDENTS

Female students presented **higher expectations of their educational path** and an overall **greater social vulnerability**. Educational expectations of girls are closely linked to gender expectations of others, may it be parents or teachers. The persistent self-imposed behavioural standards female students presented during the qualitative workshops are not a singularity, as such norms are not determined by any individual themselves. Rather, parents and teachers alike have certain expectations of and for the children; most of them gender based.

As the gender based educational expectations of the children are entwined with overall gender role expectations it is of no surprise that supposed gendered constitutions – behavioural as well as performing – are perpetuated then by children, parents, and teachers alike. It has been argued that students are influenced by their teachers' expectations and that they have an influence on



educational attainment as well. (Jussim and Harber 2005) However, expectations of high achievement, whether gendered or not, are not at the same time an indicator for actual high achievement.

While girls overall outperform boys in educational performance, they present at the same time a greater social vulnerability. First, due to parental expectation girls in some cases have an educational disadvantage, as they must comply with domestic duties, must observe certain religious prescriptions, or are forced to marry early. The observance of domestic duties requires time and produces a responsibility which not only poses a double burden but also diverts focus and effort away from the school.

In other cases, girls and female adolescents are prescribed per their family's religious tradition to observe certain rules, such as wearing a hijab. This leads to a variety of problems for those girls. Anti-Muslim sentiments and respective discriminatory behaviour and processes are at an all-time high throughout Europe. Schools, as was observed in Belgium for instance, may not allow the veiling of any girl. This poses a direct threat to educational accessibility for female students and is in direct violation of the right to an education for every child as has been recognised by the Convention on the Rights of the Child under Article 28. (Convention on the Rights of the Child. 1989. 8f.) What is more, the rejection of certain outward appearances based on prejudice creates extra stress and thus hinders the general well-being of girls. Closely associated with this are challenges for girls that occur in physical education classes. Swim classes pose a particular problem. In some cases, girls are prohibited from attending swim classes because they are wearing a hijab or similar things. Conversely, some girls simply do not wish to attend such classes and are then reprimanded for their refusal.

Two other vulnerabilities that are not sufficiently highlighted are forced child marriage and children with children. In the both cases, girls and female adolescents from specific regions are more affected than others, which in in consequence affects girls with a migratory background more than girls without.

"Marriage before the age of 18 is a fundamental violation of human rights. Many factors interact to place a child at risk of marriage, including poverty, the perception that marriage will provide 'protection', family honor [sic!], social norms, customary or religious laws that condone the practice, an inadequate legislative framework and the state of a country's civil registration



system. While the practice is more common among girls than boys, it is a violation of rights regardless of sex." (UNICEF. 2015.)

Early and forced marriage effects girls disproportionally more often than boys. The practice not only threatens the overall well-being but also undermines the educational performance early on, and in many cases obstructs the way to secondary and higher education for girls.

The topic of unaccompanied and separated mothers has been specifically stressed during the qualitative research by experts.

"The education of unaccompanied and separated mothers (children with children) is a real challenge. How to reconcile motherhood and student life when you are alone and far from your family and country? The question arises every day for these young girls who tell how difficult it is for them to get up, go to class, study and care for their baby. It's only when the baby sleeps that they finally have a bit of time to do their homework. They need more attention!"

#### MALE STUDENTS

Findings of both the qualitative research and the research literature found that male students present a **greater overall risk of lower educational attainment**. Further, special attention must be placed on the disproportionately **higher vulnerability of unaccompanied minors** compared to accompanied minors, as **almost 90** % of all unaccompanied minors arriving in Europe **are male**.

Whether they present a migration background or not, boys across Europe are persistently underperforming in school in comparison to girls. Male students with a migratory background may then be double-jeopardised, especially those with refugee history.

During the qualitative research, male refugee students, more than any other group, presented a higher tendency of underperformance in school. The major factor identified having an influence on educational performance of boys and male adolescents – as it presented with the girls – were gender role expectations. Especially within the 13-16 age groups, male students presented a higher propensity for missing classes, confrontations with teachers and other authorities, and other behavioural problems; as was the case in Belgium and Germany. Further, the educational expectations teachers have of the boys in some cases leaves to be desired. Other than with girls,



gender bias against boys seems to influence behaviour asymmetrically, thereby risking failures in performance and long-term performance discrepancies in comparison to girls.

What is more, early school drop-out rates are higher within the male student population than in the female. Two possible factors detected during the qualitative research are high expectation of the male adolescents to help provide for the family and administrative difficulties with handling behavioural deviance which in the case of refugee children might stem from experiences of forced migration. In terms of the second possible factor, not much has been accomplished yet. Risk groups are not being identified and the possibility of psychological issues of refugee children are not addressed properly.

"I also went to schools sometimes because of my patients. I have contact with social workers, teachers, directors, etc. There are misunderstandings. The problem is that traumatised people inevitably have little trust in themselves and therefore little trust in others and in institutions. The more traumatised we are, the more thoughts we have. That is also a result that we have presented. They are suspicious and it is normal. There is an Arabic proverb: " He who burns his tongue from soup will blow in yogurt." If neither social workers nor the school nor the teachers understand why the child has this behaviour, this head, it is immediately interpreted in a discriminatory way, but the children simply cannot help themselves. They cannot understand why children do not trust their statements. They take it personally or blame it on the responsibility of the child and say: "You are responsible for your behaviour". They cannot comprehend the causality between trauma and behaviour. In any case, there is a lack of education in this context. I did three sessions for the police in Jena on how to deal with the refugees. All authorities at all levels lack understanding for the situation traumatized people find themselves in." [Healthcare specialist in Germany]

"In 2018, a majority of unaccompanied minors were males (86%). Three quarters were aged 16 to 17 (14800 persons), while those aged 14 to 15 accounted for 17% (3400 persons) and those aged less than 14 for 7% (1400 persons). Over half of asylum applicants considered to be unaccompanied minors in the EU in 2018 were the citizens of six countries: Afghanistan (16%), Eritrea (10%), Pakistan or Syria (both 7%) and Guinea or Iraq (both 6%)." (Eurostat. 2019.)

According to the European Council for Refugees and Exiles (ECRE) in Belgium unaccompanied male minors are especially confronted with high risk situations in the European host countries. In many cases, "they are perceived as a threat", "face special vulnerabilities, and their rights are



often denied." What is more, more than often, education for this group is out of the question. Asylum policies, administrative inconsistencies, and other structural problems keep these male boys and adolescence from entering school more than any other vulnerable group. During the qualitative expert interview, ECRE, in fact, has argued "that unaccompanied children should be sent to integrated education based on the principle of the best interest of the child" instead of further jeopardising their future well-being.

# 7 Conclusion

Gender plays a significant role in the socio-educational integration of refugee and migrant children. Identity, family, school environment, educational attainment, and culture have been identified as the main gender-related dimensions. In fact, in all countries gender has presented to be intricately linked to the other two main topics of psycho-social wellbeing and intercultural competence. Gender has a high degree influence on bifactor and trifactor jeopardy of these children, as it intersects not only with migration and education but also with ethnical prejudice, racism, and discrimination. In other words, this means that gender doubles or triples vulnerabilities at the intersection with migration and education and vice versa, as well as with psycho-social wellbeing and intercultural competences. As the main facilitators gender sensitive policies, curricula, and training (CPD for teachers) have been identified. The main barriers included gender bias (towards both genders) and gender-based discrimination and missing or insufficient gender-related protection services.

While this report selected the strongest commonalities from cross-country qualitative data of all participating partners of the IMMERSE project, it is of importance to note that certain data has differed between countries. This is due to the variety of country of origin of the children and the specific conditions of each host country. This is particularly true for unaccompanied minors, of which the majority is male. In comparison, Italy and Greece show significantly higher numbers of unaccompanied minors and respectively a higher number of vulnerable male children and adolescents. In turn, their protection is still underrepresented and their access to integrated education often barred by insufficient access to protection services as well as inadequate policies as was reiterated by macro level experts of the European Council on Refugees and Exiles (ECRE) in Belgium.



The tables below identify the outcomes, demographic information, and determinants which have emerged from the qualitative data as well as the research literature and at which level stakeholders.

Outcome	Micro	Meso	Macro
Behaviour	Х	Х	
Peer attachment	Х		
Familial gender roles	X		
Familial values	X		
Religious beliefs	х		
Teacher-peer attachment	Х	Х	
Gender stereotypes	Х	Х	Х
Gender bias	X	Х	Х
Educational expectations	X	Х	
Student performance	X		
Shifts in gender roles	X		
Cultural dissonance	Х	х	

Table 1 Outcomes Emerging from Qualitative Data

Demographic Information		Meso	Macro
Age	Х	Х	
Gender	Х		
Country of origin	Х	Х	
Gender of family members		Х	
Former education		Х	

Table 2 Demographic Information Emerging from Qualitative Dat

Determinant		Meso	Macro
Experience of gender-based discrimination	Х	Х	Х
Parents attitudes towards education	Х	Х	
School environment – head of school		Х	
School environment – teachers		х	



Gender-sensitive training – CPD for teachers		х	
Educational performance by gender	Х		Х
Educational policies		Х	Х
Gender policies		Х	Х
Gender coeducation		Х	Х

Table 3 Determinants Emerging from Qualitative Data

Outcome		Meso	Macro
Gender bias	Х	Х	Х
Gender-based violence	Х	Х	
Educational attainment by gender	Х		Х

Table 4 Outcome Emerging from Research Literature

Demographic Information	Micro	Meso	Macro
Reasons for migration	X		
Factors of mixed migration	х	Х	Х
Gender-related health issues		Х	Х
Education attainment level by gender	х		х

Table 5 Demographic Information Emerging from Research Literature

Determinant	Micro	Meso	Macro
Gender-sensitive curriculum		Х	Х
Gender mainstreaming		Х	Х
Access to protection services		Х	Х
Access to mental health services		х	Х

Table 6 Determinants Emerging from Research Literature



## Annex

















32

Report on Gender Issues regarding research on Refugee and Migrant Children Andrea Rutzen / Anne-Sophie Krys









# Bibliography

- Alsan, M. Xing at al. "Childhood Illness and the Gender Gap in Adolescent Education: Evidence from 38 Low and Middle Income Countries." *Pediatrics*. Vol. 140(1). 2017:
- Andall, Jacqueline. "Gendered Mobilities and Work in Europe: An Introduction." *Journal of Ethnic* and Migration Studies. Vol. 39 (4). 2013: 525-534.

https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2013.745229.

Belgian Contact Point of the European Migration Network. 2016 Annual Report on Asylum and Migration Policies in Belgium. 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/home-

affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/02a\_belgium\_annual\_policy\_report\_2016\_en.pdf.

Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung. Bevölkerung mit Migrationshintergrund I.

http://www.bpb.de/nachschlagen/zahlen-und-fakten/soziale-situation-in-

deutschland/61646/

migrationshintergrund-i.

- Brubaker, Rogers. "The 'diaspora' Diaspora." *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. Vol. 28(1). 2005: 1-19. http://www.urbanlab.org/articles/Brubaker%202005%20Diaspora.pdf.e
- Buchmann, Claudia, Thomas A. DiPrete and Anne McDaniel. "Gender Inequalities in Education." Annual Review of Sociology. 34(1). 2008: 319-337.

https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.soc.34.040507.134719.

- Carling, Jørgen. "Gender Dimensions of International Migration." *Global Migration Perspectives. No.35.* 2005.
- Creese, Gillian. "Gender, Generation and Identities in Vancouver's African Diaspora." *African Diaspora.* Vol. 6(2). 2014: 155-178. https://doi.org/10.1163/18725457-12341245.

DOMiD. Dokumentationszentrum und Museum über die Migration in Deutschland.

Migrationsgeschichte in Deutschland. Migrationsgeschichte in Deutschland.

https://www.domid.org/angebot/aufsaetze/essay-migrationsgeschichte-in-deutschland.

European Commission. Policies: Justice and Fundamental Rights: Gender Equality.

https://ec.europa.eu/info/policies/justice-and-fundamental-rights/gender-equality\_en.

European Institute for Gender Equality. *Glossary of Gender Mainstreaming Concepts and Definitions*.

https://eige.europa.eu/gender-mainstreaming/concepts-and-definitions.

European Institute for Gender Equality. What is Gender Mainstreaming.

https://eige.europa.eu/gender-mainstreaming/what-is-gender-mainstreaming.



Eurostat. "Asylum applicants considered to be unaccompanied minors. Almost 20000 unaccompanied minors among asylum seekers registered in the EU in 2018. One fourth are Afghans or Eritreans." *Eurostat News Release* 73/2019 – 26 April 2019. https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/2995521/9751525/3-26042019-BPEN.pdf/291c8e87-

45b5-4108-920d-7d702c1d6990.

Eurostat. "Population by Educational Attainment Level, Sex and Age (%) - Main Indicators." Data last updated on 10 Oct. 2019. Data extracted on 09. Nov. 2019. http://appsso.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/nui/submitViewTableAction.do

Eurostat. "Teachers in the EU." 2015. Data extracted on 10 Nov. 2019.

https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/products-eurostat-news/-/EDN-20171004-1.

- Fearon, D. James. *What is Identity (As We Now Use the Word)?* Stanford: Stanford University. 1999. http://www.stanford.edu/~jfearon/papers/iden1v2.pdf.
- Fleury, Anjali. "Understanding Women and Migration: A Literature Review." *KNOMAD Working Paper 8.* World Bank. 2016.
- Hu, Jingchu et al. "Gender Differences in PTSD: Susceptibility and Resilience." In: Ed. Alvinius,
  Aida. Gender Differences in Different Contexts. London: IntechOpen Ltd. 2017: 21-42.
  https://www.intechopen.com/books/gender-differences-in-different-contexts/gender-differences-in-ptsd-susceptibility-and-resilience.
- International Organization of Migration (IOM). *Gender and Migration*. https://www.iom.int/genderand-migration.
- Jhangiani, Rajiv and Hammond Tarry. *Principles of Social Psychology 1st International Edition*. Victoria, B.C.: BCcampus. 2014. https://opentextbc.ca/socialpsychology/.
- Jussim, Lee and Kent D. Harber. "Teacher Expectations and Self-fulfilling Prophecies: Known and Unknowns, Resolved and Unresolved Controversies." *Personality and Social Psychology Review*. 9(2). 2005: 131-155.
- Klein, Jonathan D. and Errol R. Alden. "Children, Gender, Education, and Health." *Pediatrics*. Vol. 140(1). 2017: 1-2. https://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/140/1/e20171322.
- Kofman et al. "Gendered Migrations: Towards Gender Sensitive Policies in the UK." *Asylum and Migration Working Paper 6*. London: Institute for Public Policy Research. 2005. https://www.ippr.org/files/images/media/files/publication/2011/05/migrationwp6gender\_ 1362.pdf.



Majzub, Rohaty Mohd and Maisarah Muhammad Rais. "Boys' Underachievement: Male versus Female Teachers." *Procedia Social and Behavioural Sciences*. Vol. 7. 2010: 685–690.

Manlosa, Aisa and Denise Magaret Matias. "From Gender Parity to Gender Equality: Changing Women's Lived Realities." *The Current Column*. German Development Institute/Deutsches Institut für Entwicklungspolitik (DIE). 2018.

https://www.die-gdi.de/uploads/media/German\_Development\_Institute\_Manlosa\_Matias\_ 05.03.2018.pdf.

- Martino, Wayne and Goli Rezai-Rashti. "Rethinking the Influence of Male Teachers: Investigating Gendered and Raced Authority in an Elementary School in Toronto." *Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies.* Vol. 34 (5). 2012: 258-281.
- Morokvašić, Mirjana. "Gendering Migration." *Migracijske i etničke teme.* Vol. 30 (3). 2014: 355– 378. https://doi.org/10.11567/met.30.3.4.
- OECD.Stat. "Distribution of Teachers by Age and Gender." 2017. Data extracted on 12 Nov. 2019. https://stats.oecd.org/Index.aspx?DataSetCode=EAG\_PERS\_SHARE\_AGE.
- Parvikko, Tuija. "Conception of Gender Equality; Similarity and Difference." In: Keränen, Marja. Ed. *Finnish "Undemocracy": Essays on Gender and Politics*. Helinski: Finnish Political Science Association. 1990: 89-111.
- Phalet, Karen et al. "Old and new inequalities in educational attainment. Ethnic minorities in the Belgian Census 1991-2001." *Ethinicities.* Vol. 7(3). 2007: 390-415. https://www.ssoar.info/ssoar/bitstream/handle/document/23056/ssoar-ethnicities-2007-3-phalet\_et\_al-old\_and\_new\_inequalities\_in.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y&lnkname=ssoarethnicities-2007-3-phalet\_et\_al-old\_and\_new\_inequalities\_in.pdf.
- Razavi, Shahrashoub and Carol Miller. "From WID to GAD: Conceptual Shifts in the Women and Development Discourse." *Occasional Paper 1*. United Nations Research Institute for Social Development. Geneva. 1995. http://unrisd.org/unrisd/website/document.nsf/

ab82a6805797760f80256b4f005da1ab/d9c3fca78d3db32e80256b67005b6ab5/\$FILE/opb1.pdf

- Sekhar, Arjun, and J. Parameswari. "Trailing Gender stereotype." International Journal of Interdisciplinary Research in Arts and Humanities. Vol. II (2). 2017: 45-47. https://zenodo.org/record/845467.
- Stimpson, Catharine R. and Gilbert Herdt. Eds. *Critical Terms for the Study of Gender*. Chicago: Chicago University Press. 2014.



- Statista. Foreign Population of Belgium in 2019, by Origin. *Statista Research Department*. 2019. https://www.statista.com/statistics/517235/foreign-population-of-belgium-by-origin/.
- Subrahmanian, Ramya. "Gender equality in education: Definitions and measurements." International Journal of Educational Development. Vol. 25 (4). 2005: 395-407.
- UNESCO. Global Education Monitoring Report. Accountability in Education: Meeting our Commitments. Paris: UNESCO. 2017.
- UNESCO. Global Education Monitoring Report. Gender Review: Meeting our Commitments to Gender Equality in Education. Paris: UNESCO. 2018.

UNICEF. "Child Marriage." 2019. https://data.unicef.org/topic/child-protection/child-marriage/.

 Verloo, Mieke and Emanuela Lombardo. "Contested Gender Equality and Policy Variety in Europe: Introducing a Critical Frame Analysis Approach." In: Verloo, Mieke. Ed. *Multiple Meanings of Gender Equality. A Critical Frame Analysis of Gender Policies in Europe.* Budapest, New York: Central European University Press. 2007: 21-49.

